

[Submitting Counsel on Signature Page]

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE: JUUL LABS, INC., MARKETING,  
SALES PRACTICES, AND PRODUCTS  
LIABILITY LITIGATION

Case No. 19-md-02913-WHO

**JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT  
CONFERENCE STATEMENT AND  
PROPOSED AGENDA**

This Document Relates to:

**ALL ACTIONS**

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 16-10(d) and the Court's December 6, 2021 Minute Order (ECF No. 2611), counsel for Defendants Juul Labs, Inc. ("JLI"), Altria,<sup>1</sup> Director Defendants,<sup>2</sup> E-Liquid Defendants,<sup>3</sup> Retailer Defendants,<sup>4</sup> and Distributor Defendants<sup>5</sup> (collectively

<sup>1</sup> "Altria" refers to Altria Group, Inc., and the Altria-affiliated entities named in Plaintiffs' Consolidated Class Action Complaint and Consolidated Master Complaint (collectively, "Complaints"), *see* ECF Nos. 387, 388.

<sup>2</sup> "Director Defendants" refers to Messrs. James Monsees, Adam Bowen, Nicholas Pritzker, Hoyoung Huh, and Riaz Valani.

<sup>3</sup> "E-Liquid Defendants" refers to Mother Murphy's Labs, Inc., Alternative Ingredients, Inc., Tobacco Technology, Inc., and Eliquitech, Inc.

<sup>4</sup> "Retailer Defendants" refers to Chevron Corporation, Circle K Stores, Inc., Speedway LLC, 7-Eleven, Inc., Walmart, and Walgreen Co.

<sup>5</sup> "Distributor Defendants" refers to McLane Company, Inc., Eby-Brown Company, LLC, and Core-Mark Holding Company, Inc.

1 “Defendants”), and Plaintiffs’ Co-Lead Counsel (“Plaintiffs”) (collectively referred to herein as  
 2 the “Parties”) respectfully provide this Joint Case Management Statement in advance of the  
 3 Further Case Management Conference scheduled for February 25, 2022.

4 **I. PARTICIPANT INFORMATION**

5 The February 25, 2022 CMC will proceed by Zoom. Anyone who wishes to attend the  
 6 conference virtually must log in using the information available at:  
 7 <https://www.cand.uscourts.gov/judges/orrick-william-h-who/>.

8 **II. ISSUES TO BE DISCUSSED BELOW AND PROPOSED AGENDA**

9       1. Status of Case Filings and Dismissals  
 10      2. Case Management Matters  
 11      3. Discovery Status  
 12      4. ADR Status

13 **III. STATUS OF CASE FILINGS AND DISMISSALS**

14       As of February 23, 2022, approximately 3,215<sup>6</sup> cases are pending in this MDL, naming  
 15 109 defendants. A list of these defendants is attached as **Exhibit A**. To date, 2,580 personal  
 16 injury cases and 578 government entity cases (including 525 school districts, 25 counties, 2 cities,  
 17 and 26 tribes) have been filed in this MDL. 685 MDL plaintiffs have voluntarily dismissed their  
 18 cases (658 personal injury plaintiffs, 25 class plaintiffs, and 2 school districts); 237 cases have  
 19 been dismissed without prejudice pursuant to CMO No. 8; and 53 other cases are subject to  
 20 pending motions to dismiss without prejudice that have not yet been ruled upon. Furthermore,  
 21 154 case dismissals without prejudice have been converted to dismissals with prejudice pursuant  
 22 to CMO No. 8.

23       There are 616 complaints pending in JCCP 5052, which is assigned to Judge David S.  
 24 Cunningham of the Los Angeles Superior Court as the Coordination Trial Judge. There are 83  
 25 government entity cases, including 78 school districts, and 535 personal injury cases brought on  
 26

---

27       <sup>6</sup> The numbers in this Statement reflect the Parties’ good faith estimates based on reasonably  
 28 available information. The Parties will continue to work together to align their data and resolve  
 any inconsistencies.

1 behalf of over 3,600 individual personal injury plaintiffs. There are 26 defendants named in those  
 2 JCCP cases.

3 The Parties are also aware of 15 pending cases filed by State Attorneys General  
 4 specifically: California, Illinois, Hawai'i, New York, Louisiana, Mississippi, Minnesota,  
 5 Washington D.C., Pennsylvania, New Mexico, Massachusetts, Colorado, Alaska and  
 6 Washington; in addition, the State Attorney General of North Carolina filed a case against  
 7 Director Defendants. Plaintiffs' Liaison Counsel continue their outreach to various State  
 8 Attorneys General to discuss cooperation with this MDL.

9 An update on matters of significance (including hearings, schedules, deadlines,  
 10 depositions, substantive orders, and trial dates) in Related Actions as defined by the Joint  
 11 Coordination Order (CMO 9, ECF No. 572 at 1, 3), is attached hereto as **Exhibit B**.

12 **IV. CASE MANAGEMENT MATTERS**

13 **A. Personal Injury Bellwether Cases**

14 1. Third Trial -- Personal Injury Bellwether Case

15 After the last CMC, the Court issued an order asking the parties to "file under seal letters,  
 16 not to exceed two pages per side, identifying each side's picks for the third PI bellwether slot."  
 17 (ECF No. 2799, 1/21/22 Minute Entry) The parties, after review of the Court's prior orders,  
 18 agree that the Court already decided this issue: "The first four personal injury trials will proceed  
 19 in the following order absent changed circumstances: Bain, Pesce, Westfaul, and Fish." (ECF  
 20 No. 2111, 7/16/21 Minute Order) Accordingly, the parties have not submitted further briefing on  
 21 this issue.

22 2. Additional B.B. Trial Witnesses

23 The parties submitted briefing, as ordered by the Court, on the four additional trial  
 24 witnesses disclosed for the B.B. trial. (ECF No. 2899, ECF No. 2906)

25 3. Census of Cases

26 The parties are working on a joint proposed order regarding the census of unfiled cases  
 27 and the production of medical records and anticipate submitting to the Court shortly.

1                   **B.       Tribal Cases**

2                   On January 24, 2022, the Court entered a schedule for the tribal cases. The parties are  
 3 working together to selecting an appropriate tribal bellwether case for trial.

4                   **C.       Government Entity**

5                   The parties continue to discuss the implications of Plaintiffs' January 28, 2022 case-  
 6 specific expert reports for the Government Entity cases. While discussions are ongoing with  
 7 respect to the need for additional fact and expert discovery, and the Plaintiffs are not conceding at  
 8 this point that additional fact discovery is warranted, the parties agree that the deadline for  
 9 Defendants' responsive expert reports and the deadlines for summary judgment and *Daubert*  
 10 motions should be vacated, pending the entry of a new pretrial schedule for the Government  
 11 Entity cases. The parties further agree to report on these matters to the Court in connection with  
 12 the March Case Management Conference, including a proposed schedule.

13                   **D.       Class Case**

14                   Per the Court's January 21, 2022 minute order (ECF No. 2799), the parties have conferred  
 15 and agree they will submit a proposed schedule (or schedules) for the remaining pretrial  
 16 proceedings as to any class that may be certified (if any), within one week of any certification  
 17 order.

18                   **V.       DISCOVERY STATUS**

19                   The MDL Plaintiffs are holding weekly calls with JCCP counsel regarding discovery, as  
 20 detailed by the Joint Coordination Order (CMO No. 9, ECF No. 572) and the Deposition Protocol  
 21 (CMO No. 10, ECF No. 573).

22                   **VI.      ADR STATUS**

23                   Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 16-10(d), the Parties report that they continue to confer with  
 24 Settlement Master Thomas J. Perrelli and cooperate with his recommendations.

25

26

27

28

1 Dated: February 23, 2022

Respectfully submitted,

2

3 By: /s/ Renee D. Smith

4 Renee D. Smith (*pro hac vice*)  
5 **KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**  
6 300 N. LaSalle  
7 Chicago, IL 60654  
Telephone: (312) 862-2310

By: /s/ Sarah R. London

Sarah R. London  
**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &**  
**BERNSTEIN**  
275 Battery Street, Fl. 29  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 956-1000

8 By: /s/ Peter A. Farrell

9 David M. Bernick (*pro hac vice*)  
10 Peter A. Farrell (*pro hac vice*)  
11 **KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**  
12 1301 Pennsylvania Ave, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Telephone: (202) 389-5959

By: /s/ Dena C. Sharp

Dena C. Sharp  
**GIRARD SHARP LLP**  
601 California St., Suite 1400  
San Francisco, CA 94108  
Telephone: (415) 981-4800

13 By: /s/ Gregory P. Stone

14 Gregory P Stone, SBN 78329  
15 Bethany W. Kristovich, SBN 241891  
16 **MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP**  
17 350 South Grand Avenue  
Fiftieth Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90071-3426  
Telephone: (213) 683-9100

By: /s/ Dean Kawamoto

Dean Kawamoto  
**KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.**  
1201 Third Ave., Ste. 3200  
Seattle, WA 98101  
Telephone: (206) 623-1900

18 *Attorneys for Defendant Juul Labs, Inc.*

By: /s/ Ellen Relkin

Ellen Relkin  
**WEITZ & LUXENBERG**  
700 Broadway  
New York, NY 10003  
Telephone: (212) 558-5500

23 *Co-Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs*

24

25

26

27

28

1 By: /s/ John C. Massaro

2  
3 **ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER  
LLP**

4 John C. Massaro (admitted pro hac vice)  
5 Jason A. Ross (admitted pro hac vice)  
6 601 Massachusetts Ave., N.W.  
7 Washington D.C. 20001  
8 Telephone: (202) 942-5000  
9 Facsimile: (202) 942-5999  
john.massaro@arnoldporter.com  
Jason.ross@arnoldporter.com

10  
11 *Attorneys for Defendants Altria Group, Inc.  
and Philip Morris USA Inc.*

12 By: /s/ Eugene Illovsy

13 **BOERSCH & ILLOVSKY LLP**

14 Eugene Illovsy  
15 Martha Boersch  
16 Matthew Dirkes  
17 1611 Telegraph Ave., Suite 806  
Oakland, CA 94612  
Telephone: (415) 500-6643  
eugene@boersch-illovsy.com  
martha@boersch-illovsy.com  
matt@boersch-illovsy.com

18 *Attorneys for Defendant Adam Bowen*

19 By: /s/ James Kramer

20 **ORRICK HERRINGTON &  
SUTCLIFFE LLP**

21 James Kramer  
22 Roland Chang  
23 The Orrick Building  
24 405 Howard Street  
25 San Francisco, CA 94105-2669  
26 Telephone: (415) 773-5700  
jkramer@orrick.com  
rdchang@orrick.com

27 *Attorneys for Defendant James Monsees*

28 By: /s/ Michael J. Guzman

1 **KELLOGG, HANSEN, TODD, FIGEL &  
FREDERICK, P.L.L.C.**

2 Mark C. Hansen  
3 Michael J. Guzman  
4 David L. Schwartz  
5 Sumner Square, 1615 M St., N.W., Suite 400  
6 Washington, DC 20036  
7 Telephone: (202) 326-7910  
mguzman@kellogghansen.com

8 *Attorneys for Defendants Nicholas Pritzker,  
Riaz Valani, and Hoyoung Huh*

1 By: /s/ Mitchell B. Malachowski

2 **TYSON & MENDES, LLP**

3 James E. Sell  
4 Mitchell B. Malachowski  
5 Stephen Budica  
6 April M. Cristal  
7 523 4th Street, Suite 100  
8 San Rafael, CA 94901  
Telephone: (628) 253-5070  
jsell@tysonmendes.com  
mmalachowski@tysonmendes.com  
sbudica@tysonmendes.com  
acristal@tysonmendes.com

9 *Attorneys for Defendants Mother Murphy's  
10 Labs, Inc., and Alternative Ingredients, Inc.*

11 By: /s/ Michael L. O'Donnell

12 **WHEELER TRIGG O'DONNELL LLP**

13 Michael L. O'Donnell  
14 James E. Hooper  
15 Marissa Ronk  
16 370 17th Street, Ste. 4500  
Denver, CO 80202  
Telephone: (303) 244-1850  
Odonnell@wtotrial.com  
hooper@wtotrial.com  
Ronk@wtotrial.com

17 *Attorneys for Defendant McLane Company,  
18 Inc.*

19 By: /s/ Robert Scher

20 **FOLEY & LARDNER LLP**

21 Robert Scher  
Peter N. Wang  
Graham D. Welch  
Dyana K. Mardon  
90 Park Avenue  
22 New York, NY 10016-1314  
Telephone: (212) 682-7474  
Facsimile: (212) 687-2329  
rscher@foley.com  
pwang@foley.com  
gwelch@foley.com  
dmardon@foley.com

23 *Attorney for Defendants Tobacco  
Technology, Inc., and Eliquitech, Inc.*

24 By: /s/ Christopher J. Esbrook

25 **ESBROOK LAW P.C.**

26 Christopher J. Esbrook  
David F. Pustilnik  
Michael S. Kozlowski  
77 W. Wacker, Suite 4500  
Chicago, IL 60601  
Telephone: (312) 319-7681  
christopher.esbrook@esbrooklaw.com  
david.pustilnik@esbrooklaw.com  
michael.kozlowski@esbrooklaw.com

27 *Attorneys for Defendants Eby-Brown  
28 Company, LLC, Circle K Stores, and 7-  
Eleven, Inc., Speedway, and Walgreen Co.*

1 By: /s/ David R. Singh

2 **WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP**

3 David R. Singh  
4 Bambo Obaro  
5 201 Redwood Shores Parkway, 6th Floor  
6 Redwood Shores, CA 94065  
7 Telephone: (650) 802-3083  
david.singh@weil.com  
bambo.obaro@weil.com

8  
9 *Attorneys for Defendant Core-Mark Holding  
10 Company, Inc.*

11 By: /s/ Donald F. Zimmer, Jr.

12 **KING & SPALDING LLP**

13 Donald F. Zimmer, Jr.  
14 Quyen L. Ta  
15 Jennifer T. Stewart  
16 50 California Street, Suite 3300  
17 San Francisco, CA 94111  
18 Telephone: (415) 318-1200  
fzimmer@kslaw.com  
qta@kslaw.com  
jstewart@kslaw.com

19 *Attorneys for Defendant Walmart Inc.*

20 By: /s/ Charles C. Correll Jr.

21 **KING & SPALDING LLP**

22 Andrew T. Bayman (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
1180 Peachtree Street, Suite 1600  
23 Atlanta, GA 30309  
24 Telephone: (404) 572-4600  
abayman@kslaw.com

25 and

26 Charles C. Correll, Jr.  
Matthew J. Blaschke  
Alessandra M. Givens  
50 California Street, Suite 3300  
27 San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 318-1200  
ccorrell@kslaw.com  
mblaschke@kslaw.com  
agivens@kslaw.com

28 *Attorneys for Defendant Chevron Corporation*

2377795.6